

Growth for Rural Advancement and Sustainable Progress

Outcome Monitoring Survey

Outcome Survey

In April 2024, the International Trade Centre (ITC) and its Growth for Rural Advancement and Sustainable Progress (GRASP) partners conducted the first comprehensive outcome survey to evaluate the progress of the GRASP project. Utilizing a paper-based tool that had been tested in the field, the survey was transitioned to a digital format through Computer-Assisted Personal Interviewing (CAPI) with technical support from ODK. This digital shift enabled efficient data collection in both online and offline environments. Unlike traditional sample-based surveys, this study adopted a census-based approach to include the maximum number of project beneficiaries.

The survey utilized data from Means of Verification (MOVs) collected from previous activities related to outcome indicators. Attendance sheets were digitized to streamline data management and ensure accuracy, allowing classification by gender and partner affiliation. A team of 110 trained enumerators, equipped with detailed lists of GRASP beneficiaries, conducted the survey. Of these, 106 actively participated in the data collection phase. Approximately 17,000 individuals were digitized across different indicators, with over 11,000 unique records documented.

Partner organizations successfully traced and mobilized approximately 80% of the targeted SMEs. The survey yielded 9,701 responses, of which 9,300 were deemed valid for further analysis. The CAPI approach facilitated real-time support to address field challenges, and ITC conducted additional back checks on some of the covered SMEs during field monitoring to verify the accuracy and coverage of the data.

Outcome Indicators

The GRASP project's outcome indicators were meticulously constructed based on the previous logframe, ensuring continuity and relevance by linking them to the indicators from the earlier logframe. These indicators were designed to measure the progress and impact of the project comprehensively. The table below lists the new indicators with the previous one.

	Result Chain	New Indicators	Linked Indicators from Previous Logframe	Targets
Outcome	Outcome 1: Enhanced productivity, profitability and sustainability of men and women owned Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) involved in primary production, service provision and value addition in and around selected clusters of production within the provinces of Balochistan and Sindh	1.1. Number of interventions supported agribusiness and business environment-related policies, strategies, plans or regulation approved in favor of the competitiveness of SMEs (<i>disaggregated by province, type of policy/ strategy and gender focus</i>)	Percentage of agribusiness and business environment-related policies, strategies or regulations implemented in favor of the competitiveness of SMEs	13 out of 43 total policy interventions (30%)
		1.2. Number of SMEs including primary producers applying cleaner production and climate smart agriculture and livestock technologies and practices. (disaggregated by sex, sector, value chain and province) (Aligned with EURF 2.20)	Percentage of SMEs including producers applying environmentally sustainable cleaner production technologies, water saving, desertification mitigating measures, and climate smart agricultural practices	13,500
		1.3 Number of SMEs having transacted business as part of national or international value chains (gender-disaggregated) (ITC C3/C4)	Number of SMEs having transacted business as part of national or international value chains (gender-disaggregated) (ITC C3/C4)	4609

Result Chain	New Indicators	Linked Indicators from Previous Logframe	Targets
	1.4. Percentage increase in sales turnover of supported SMEs in selected value chains (disaggregated by sex, sector, value chain and province)	Percentage change in sales turnover of supported SMEs in selected value chains	50%
		Percentage of agribusinesses sourcing from producer SMEs within targeted value chains	50%
	1.5 Number of full time equivalent (FTE) jobs supported/ sustained in the targeted SMEs (disaggregated by age, sex, sector, value chain and province) (Aligned with EURF 2.11) (CI-D1)	Percentage change in full time equivalent (FTE) jobs supported in assisted SMEs	30%
	1.6. Percentage increase in investment in the targeted value chain by supported SMEs (disaggregated by sex, sector, value chain and province) CI-C5)	Percentage change in investment in the targeted value chain by supported SMEs	40%
	1.7. Amount of finance accessed by SMEs in selected sectors including green finance (disaggregated by sex, sector, value chain and province)	Amount of finance accessed by SMEs in selected sectors including green finance	USD 9 million (including USD 5 Million from Matching Grants)

Survey Outcome Results

Outcome 1.2. Application of cleaner production and climate smart agriculture and livestock technologies and practices by Primary producers¹. (Disaggregated by sex, sector, value chain and province) (Aligned with EURF 2.20)

Based on 9,300 beneficiaries' responses, GRASP found that 5,624 SMEs have adopted cleaner production and climate-smart technologies and practices in agriculture and livestock. In Balochistan, a total of 1,710 SMEs is practicing cleaner production and climate-smart agriculture and livestock technologies, comprising 666 women-led and 1,044 men-led businesses. Sector-wise, 744 SMEs are involved in horticulture, while 966 are engaged in livestock. Sindh demonstrates a higher overall adoption with 3,914 SMEs, comprising 1,107 women-led and 2,807 men-led businesses. In terms of sector distribution, 2,864 SMEs are in horticulture, and 1,050 are in livestock. This results in a combined total of 5,624 SMEs across both provinces, with 1,773 women-led (31.53%) and 3,851 men-led (68.47%). Sector-wise, 3,608 SMEs are involved in horticulture (64.15%), and 2,016 in livestock (35.85%).

When examining the value chain distribution, the data reveals that the highest adoption is seen in the onion value chain, with 1,155 SMEs (20.5%), followed by goat (991 SMEs, 17.6%), and date (840 SMEs, 14.9%). Other notable value chains include mango (541 SMEs, 9.6%), banana (521 SMEs, 9.3%), and cattle (503 SMEs, 8.9%). Lesser adoption rates are observed in the tomato (430 SMEs, 7.6%), poultry (296 SMEs, 5.3%), sheep (217 SMEs, 3.9%), grape (71 SMEs, 1.3%), olive (35 SMEs, 0.6%), and other value chains (24 SMEs, 0.4%).

Province	Total Practicing SMEs	By Gender		By Sector	
		Women	Men	Horticulture	Livestock
BALUCHISTAN	1,710	666	1,044	744	966

¹ Application of climate smart agriculture, good agricultural practices, value addition, SPS are contributing to cleaner production practices and post-harvest losses.

SINDH	3,914	1,107	2,807	2,864	1,050
Total	5,624	1,773	3,851	3,608	2,016
<i>Percentage</i>		31.53%	68.47%	64.15%	35.85%

Table 1: SMEs including Primary Producers applying cleaner production and climate smart agriculture and livestock technologies and practices (By Province, Sex and Sector)

Value Chain	Women	Men	Total	Percentage
Onion	240	915	1,155	20.5%
Goat	637	354	991	17.6%
Date	205	635	840	14.9%
Mango	22	519	541	9.6%
Banana	2	519	521	9.3%
Cattle	208	295	503	8.9%
Tomato	99	331	430	7.6%
Poultry	234	62	296	5.3%
Sheep	109	108	217	3.9%
Grape	3	68	71	1.3%
Olive	4	31	35	0.6%
Other	10	14	24	0.4%
Total	1,773	3,851	5,624	

Table 2: SMEs including Primary Producers applying cleaner production and climate smart agriculture and livestock technologies and practices (By Value Chain)

In terms of cleaner production technologies, solar power and biofuels were adopted at farm level. In terms of Climate Smart Livestock, vaccination, fodder management, animal diagnosis and climate resilient breed management were reported as major applied practices.

1.3 Number of SMEs having transacted business as part of national or international value chains (gender-disaggregated) (ITC C3/C4)

The data indicates a high percentage of SMEs transacting business as part of national or international value chains in both Balochistan and Sindh. In Balochistan, 2,237 SMEs have transacted business, accounting for 95% of the total 2,345 SMEs in the province. Only 108 SMEs have not transacted. Sindh shows a slightly lower, yet still substantial, engagement rate with 5,651 SMEs (83%) having transacted business out of a total of 6,772 SMEs, leaving 1,121 SMEs not having transacted. Overall, 7,888 SMEs across both provinces have transacted business, representing 87% of the total 9,117 SMEs, with only 1,229 SMEs (13%) not participating in business transactions.

In Balochistan, out of the 2,237 SMEs that have transacted, 836 are women-led (37.37%) and 1,401 are men-led (62.63%). Sindh exhibits a wider gender gap, with 1,682 women-led SMEs (29.77%) and 3,969 men-led SMEs (70.23%) out of the 5,651 SMEs that have transacted. Aggregating both provinces, a total of 2,518 women-led SMEs (31.92%) and 5,370 men-led SMEs (68.08%) have engaged in business transactions. This indicates a persistent male dominance in business transactions within national and international value chains.

Province	Not Transacted	Transacted	Grand Total	<i>Percentage (of transacted)</i>
----------	----------------	------------	-------------	-----------------------------------

BALUCHISTAN	108	2237	2345	95%
SINDH	1121	5651	6772	83%
Total	1229	7888	9117	87%
<i>Percentage</i>	<i>13%</i>	<i>87%</i>		

Table 3: Number of SMEs having transacted business as part of national or international value chains (Province wise transacted/not transacted disaggregation)

Gender	Women	Men	Total
BALUCHISTAN	836	1401	2237
SINDH	1682	3969	5651
Total	2518	5370	7888
<i>Percentage</i>	<i>31.92%</i>	<i>68.08%</i>	

Table 4: Number of SMEs having transacted business as part of national or international value chains (Gender-segregation among SMEs who have transacted)


1.4. Percentage increase in sales turnover of supported SMEs in selected value chains (disaggregated by sex, sector, value chain and province)

The project has resulted in a considerable increase in sales turnover for both the horticulture and livestock sectors. The horticulture sector saw a rise of 45.7%. The livestock sector experienced an even higher growth, reflecting a 50.1% increase. The overall sales turnover across both sectors saw an increase of 46.2%.

When broken down by province, Sindh shows a substantial increase in sales turnover, a 51% rise. Balochistan, although with a lower overall turnover, also exhibited a significant growth of 25%. Collectively, the provinces achieved an overall increase of 46% in sales turnover.

Gender-disaggregated data indicates that men-led SMEs experienced a higher percentage increase in sales turnover compared to women-led SMEs. Men-led SMEs saw an increase of 47% whereas women-led SMEs saw an increase of 39%. The overall increase in sales turnover across all genders is 46%.

The value chain data reveals varying degrees of increase in sales turnover across different products. The cattle value chain experienced the highest increase, with sales rising by 75%. The tomato value chain also showed substantial growth of a 69% increase. The mango value chain saw a 60% rise. Other notable increases include the banana value chain (51%), sheep (54%), and poultry (33%). Smaller increases were observed in value chains such as olive (9%) and grape (11%).

	Annual Sales Turnover		
	Before GRASP	Now	Change 
Sector			
Horticulture	6,514,745,115	9,491,841,980	45.7%
Livestock	819,022,968	1,229,353,053	50.1%
Grand Total	7,333,768,083	10,721,195,033	46.2%
	Province		
BALUCHISTAN	1,276,522,675	1,594,062,958	25%
SINDH	6,057,245,408	9,127,132,075	51%
Grand Total	7,333,768,083	10,721,195,033	46%
Gender			

Women	843,327,579	1,171,904,535	39%
Men	6,490,340,504	9,549,140,498	47%
Transgender	100,000	150,000	50%
Grand Total	7,333,768,083	10,721,195,033	46%
Value Chain			
Banana	1,701,305,242	2,572,650,791	51%
Cattle	287,937,821	503,109,572	75%
Date	1,163,193,000	1,507,755,002	30%
Goat	368,398,600	488,261,174	33%
Grape	218,495,020	242,769,020	11%
Mango	2,099,565,000	3,358,650,008	60%
Olive	35,990,053	39,145,059	9%
Onion	959,439,800	1,200,116,400	25%
Poultry	59,402,245	79,034,010	33%
Sheep	103,284,302	158,948,297	54%
Tomato	336,757,000	570,755,700	69%
Total	7,333,768,083	10,721,195,033	46%

Table 5: Percentage increase in sales turnover of supported SMEs in selected value chains (disaggregated by sex, sector, value chain and province)

1.5 Number of full time equivalent (FTE) jobs supported/ sustained in the targeted SMEs (disaggregated by age, sex, sector, value chain and province) (Aligned with EURF 2.11) (CI-D1)

The project has supported a total of 15,287 FTE jobs, with a slight majority (53%) in Sindh (8,041 jobs) and 47% in Balochistan (7,246 jobs). This distribution indicates a relatively balanced regional impact, ensuring broad-based economic support across the provinces.

When examining sectorial distribution, the majority of FTE jobs are in the horticulture sector, accounting for 68% (10,408 jobs) of the total, while the livestock sector represents 32% (4,879 jobs). This suggests a stronger impact of the project on horticulture-related employment.

Gender-disaggregated data reveals that 10,763 FTE jobs (70.4%) are held by men, while women hold 4,520 jobs (29.6%). A minimal number of jobs (4) are held by transgender individuals. This significant gender gap indicates that while the project has been beneficial in creating jobs, there remains a need for increased efforts to support women employment in the targeted SMEs.

The age distribution of FTE job holders shows that 7,398 jobs (48%) are held by individuals aged 15 to 29, and 7,686 jobs (50%) by those aged 30 to 64. Only 203 jobs (1%) are held by individuals aged 65 and above. This suggests that the project has predominantly benefited the working-age population, with nearly equal distribution between younger and middle-aged groups.

The value chain analysis highlights the distribution of FTE jobs across various value chains. The onion value chain has the highest number of supported jobs, with 3,423 (22%) FTE jobs, followed by the date value chain with 2,163 jobs (14%), and the goat value chain with 1,920 jobs (13%). Other notable value chains include tomato (1,605 jobs, 10%), mango (1,179 jobs, 8%), and grape (994 jobs, 7%). Lesser job creation is observed in the olive (125 jobs, 1%) and poultry (960 jobs, 6%) value chains. This diverse distribution across value chains indicates the project's broad impact on different agricultural sectors.

Gender of FTE job holders	Total	Province		Sector		Age		
		Balochistan	Sindh	Horticulture	Livestock	15 to 29	30 to 64	65+
Men	10,763	4,819	5,944	7,826	2,937	5,414	5,221	128
Women	4,520	2,426	2,094	2,578	1,942	1,984	2,461	75
Transgender	4	1	3	4	0	0	4	0
Total	15,287	7,246	8,041	10,408	4,879	7,398	7,686	203
<i>Percentage</i>		47%	53%	68%	32%	48%	50%	1%

Table 6: Number of full time equivalent (FTE) jobs supported/ sustained in the targeted SMEs (gendered disaggregated by province, sector and age)

Value Chain	Men	Women	Transgender	Total	Percentage
Banana	809	110	0	919	6%
Cattle	565	342	0	907	6%
Date	1,883	280	0	2,163	14%
Goat	1,196	724	0	1,920	13%
Grape	917	77	0	994	7%
Mango	1,045	131	3	1,179	8%
Olive	92	33	0	125	1%
Onion	2,116	1,306	1	3,423	22%
Poultry	495	465	0	960	6%
Sheep	681	411	0	1,092	7%
Tomato	964	641	0	1,605	10%
Total	10,763	4,520	4	15,287	

Table 7: Number of full time equivalent (FTE) jobs supported/ sustained in the targeted SMEs (gendered disaggregated by value chain)

1.6. Percentage increase in investment in the targeted value chain by supported SMEs (disaggregated by sex, sector, value chain and province)

Investments in both the horticulture and livestock sectors have seen substantial increases. The horticulture sector's investment increased by 39%. The livestock sector experienced a 41% increase. Overall, the total investment across both sectors increased by 39%.

When broken down by province, Sindh exhibited a more significant increase in investment compared to Balochistan. In Sindh, investments increased by 44%. Balochistan saw a 26% increase in investment. Collectively, investments in both provinces rose by 39%.

Gender-disaggregated data indicates that men-led SMEs have the highest investment increase, representing a 39% increase. Women-led SMEs experienced a 38% increase. The overall increase in investment across all gender groups is 39%.

The value chain analysis reveals varying degrees of investment increases across different products. The mango value chain experienced the highest percentage increase, with investments rising by 49%. The poultry value chain also showed substantial growth, with a 60% increase. Other notable increases include onion (41%), cattle (40%), and date (40%) value chains. Smaller increases were observed in value chains such as grape (7%) and olive (32%).


Details	Investment by SME		
	Before GRASP	Current Investment	Change 
Sector			
Horticulture	3,251,214,460	4,505,707,500	39%
Livestock	693,374,900	974,570,800	41%
Grand Total	3,944,589,360	5,480,278,300	39%
Province			
BALOCHISTAN	1,110,795,500	1,398,272,000	26%
SINDH	2,833,793,860	4,082,006,300	44%
Grand Total	3,944,589,360	5,480,278,300	39%
Gender			
Women	602,958,000	833,441,800	38%
Men	3,341,581,360	4,646,286,500	39%
Transgender	50,000	550,000	1000%
Grand Total	3,944,589,360	5,480,278,300	39%
Value Chain			
Banana	687,655,000	920,207,500	34%
Cattle	248,319,400	347,826,800	40%
Date	629,598,000	880,436,000	40%
Goat	284,963,000	390,683,000	37%
Grape	261,353,000	278,629,000	7%
Mango	788,055,060	1,173,893,000	49%
Olive	28,945,000	38,099,000	32%
Onion	626,185,400	885,553,000	41%
Poultry	44,126,500	70,500,000	60%
Sheep	115,966,000	165,561,000	43%
Tomato	229,423,000	328,890,000	43%
Grand Total	3,944,589,360	5,480,278,300	39%

Table 8: Percentage increase in investment in the targeted value chain by supported SMEs (gender, sector, value chain and province)

Way Forward

Building on to this first cycle of the Outcome Survey, GRASP plans to run 2nd and 3rd iteration of the outcome survey in the remaining period of the project. This findings would guide project implementation by navigating efforts to areas where project is away from achieving its intended targets.